

## **Instructor Resources Sample**

This is a sample of the instructor materials for *Human Resources in Healthcare: Managing for Success*, Fifth Edition, by Carla Jackie Sampson, PhD, MBA, FACHE, and Bruce J. Fried, PhD.

The complete instructor materials include the following:

- Test bank
- PowerPoint slides
- Chapter overviews
- Suggested class activities and assignments
- Transition guide to the new edition

This sample includes the PowerPoint slides and the instructor manual for chapter 7.

If you adopt this text, you will be given access to the complete materials. To obtain access, e-mail your request to [hapbooks@ache.org](mailto:hapbooks@ache.org) and include the following information in your message:

- Book title
- Your name and institution name
- Title of the course for which the book was adopted and the season the course is taught
- Course level (graduate, undergraduate, or continuing education) and expected enrollment
- The use of the text (primary, supplemental, or recommended reading)
- A contact name and phone number/e-mail address we can use to verify your employment as an instructor

You will receive an e-mail containing access information after we have verified your instructor status. Thank you for your interest in this text and the accompanying instructor resources.

### **Digital and Alternative Formats**

Individual chapters of this book are available for instructors to create customized textbooks or course packs at [XanEdu/AcademicPub](http://XanEdu/AcademicPub). For more information about pricing and availability, please visit one of these preferred partners or contact Health Administration Press at [hapbooks@ache.org](mailto:hapbooks@ache.org).

# Chapter 7: Recruitment and Selection

# Learning Objectives

- Understand the major steps and decisions involved in recruitment and selection
- Discuss the factors considered by potential employees in deciding whether to accept a job offer
- Design a recruitment and selection effort for a particular job
- Address the advantages and disadvantages of internal and external recruitment and other sources of job applicants
- Explain the concepts of person–job and person–organization fit and their application to recruitment and selection
- Identify alternative selection tools and determine their relative value in the selection process

# Recruitment

- When considering recruitment strategies, attention often focuses on a set of key questions:
  - Should we recruit and promote from within, or should we focus on recruiting external applicants—or both?
  - Should we consider alternative approaches to filling jobs with full-time employees, such as outsourcing, flexible staffing, and hiring part-time or temporary employees?
  - How important is it for employees to fit in with the culture of the organization?
  - Should we favor applicants who better fit the culture but may require additional skills development to improve their technical skills?

# Factors That Influence Job Choice

- Individual characteristics are personal considerations that influence a person's job decision.
- Organizational characteristics, on the other hand, are factors associated with the organization as a whole, notably, total compensation, advancement opportunities, job security, and geographic location.
- Hot-skill premiums—temporary pay premiums added to base pay for employees with in-demand skills—have become common in healthcare, although premiums usually remain in place even after market pressures ease.

<b>Applicant</b>	<b>Minimum Standards for Job Acceptance</b>	<b>Job Description</b>
<i>Person 1: 23 years old, single</i>	<i>Pay: At least \$40,000 Benefits: Medical insurance; retirement savings plan Advancement opportunities: Very important Travel requirements: Unimportant</i>	<i>Job: Provider relations coordinator Pay: \$45,000 Benefits: Medical and dental insurance with relatively high deductible; optional vision insurance; basic and supplementary life insurance; short- and long-term disability coverage; retirement savings plan with employer matching Advancement opportunities: Recruitment done internally and externally Travel requirements: Average 25 percent travel</i>
<i>Person 2: Sole wage earner for a large family</i>	<i>Pay: At least \$70,000 Benefits: Medical and dental insurance; optional vision insurance; basic and supplementary life insurance; short- and long-term disability coverage; retirement savings plan with employer matching Advancement opportunities: Very important Travel requirements: Prefers no more than 25 percent travel</i>	<i>Job: Healthcare consultant Pay: \$68,000 Benefits: Medical, dental insurance, and vision insurance with low deductibles and copays; basic and supplementary life insurance; short- and long-term disability coverage; retirement savings plan with employer matching Advancement opportunities: Strong history of promotions within one year Travel requirements: Average 50 percent travel</i>
<i>Person 3: Spouse of a high-wage earner</i>	<i>Pay: At least \$45,000 Benefits: Unimportant Advancement opportunities: Unimportant Travel requirements: Difficulty traveling more than one week per year</i>	<i>Job: Academic medical center research assistant for multisite clinical trial Pay: \$52,000 Benefits: Medical, dental insurance, and voluntary vision insurance; basic and supplementary life insurance; short- and long-term disability coverage; retirement savings plan with employer matching Advancement opportunities: None Travel requirements: Three days per quarter to meet with other research site personnel</i>

## Exhibit 7.1 Three Hypothetical Applicants

HRIS Data	Uses in Recruitment
Skills and knowledge inventory	Identifies potential internal job candidates
Previous applicants	Identifies potential external job candidates
Recruitment source information <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Yield ratios</li> <li>• Cost</li> <li>• Cost per applicant</li> <li>• Cost per hire</li> </ul>	Helps in the analysis of cost-effectiveness of recruitment sources
Applicant tracking	Provides a method to automate many labor-intensive aspects of recruitment
Employee performance and retention information	Provides information on the success of recruitment sources used in the past

**Exhibit 7.2** Human Resources Information System Recruitment Data

General Job Search Websites	Healthcare-Specific Websites
Indeed	Health eCareers
CareerBuilder	JAMA Career Center
LinkedIn	www MedicalJobs.org
Glassdoor	MedJobsCafe.com
Simply Hired	MomMD
LinkUp	Medzilla
Snag a Job	HealthJobsNationwide.com
Facebook Job Search	HospitalCareer
Zip Recruiter	CareerVitals
Robert Half	Health Career Center

**Exhibit 7.3** Common Job Search Engines

## Exhibit 7.4

### Advantages and Disadvantages of Internal and External Recruitment

#### Recruiting Internal Candidates

##### *Advantages*

May improve employee morale and encourage valued employees to stay with the organization

Permits greater assessment of applicant abilities; candidate is a known entity

Draws from pool of applicants who have a good understanding of the organization

May be faster, and may involve lower cost for certain jobs

Provides good motivation for employee performance

May reinforce employees' sense of job security

##### *Disadvantages*

May cause morale problems among those not selected

May lead the organization to depend too heavily on internal recruitment, thereby denying itself fresh talent and new ideas

May require strong training and management development activities

May manifest the "Peter Principle" (employees may be promoted to their highest level of competence and then be promoted to and remain at a level at which they are incompetent)

May cause ripple effect in vacancies

#### Recruiting External Candidates

##### *Advantages*

Brings new ideas into the organization

May be less expensive than training internal candidates

Draws candidates who come without dysfunctional relationships with others in the organization and without involvement in organizational politics

##### *Disadvantages*

May cause morale problems for internal candidates who were not selected

May be difficult to obtain reliable information about applicant

May identify candidate who has technical skills but does not fit the culture of the organization

May require longer adjustment and socialization for new employee compared with internal candidate

# Content of the Recruiting Message

- Four types of information should be communicated to applicants:
  - Applicant qualifications: education, experience, credentials, and any other preferences that the employer has within legal constraints
  - Job basics: title, responsibilities, compensation, benefits, location, and other pertinent working conditions (e.g., night work, travel, promotion potential)
  - Application process: deadline, résumé, cover letter, transcripts, references, and contact person and address for the application packet
  - Organization and department basics: name and type of organization, department, and other information about the work environment

# Evaluating the Recruitment Function

- Common measures of the success of the recruitment function include the following:
  - Quantity and quality of applicants
  - Overall recruitment cost and cost per applicant
  - Diversity of applicants
  - Recruitment time or time-to-fill.

Type of Cost	Expenses	Type of Cost	Expenses		
Cost per hire	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Advertising, agency fees, employee referral bonuses, recruitment fairs and travel, and sign-on bonuses</li> <li>Staff time: salary, benefits, and overhead costs for employees to review applications, set up interviews, conduct interviews, check references, and make and confirm an offer</li> <li>Processing costs: opening a new file, medical examination, drug screening, and credential checking</li> <li>Travel and lodging for applicants, relocation costs</li> <li>Orientation and training</li> </ul>	Diversity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Diversity hire ratio: percentage of employees hired who self-identify as coming from a diversity group (overall and per job posting)</li> <li>Female hire ratio: percentage of externally hired employees who are female</li> </ul>	Recruitment source effectiveness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Offers by recruitment source</li> <li>Hires by recruitment source</li> <li>Employee performance (using performance evaluation information and promotion rates)</li> <li>Employee retention by recruitment source</li> <li>First-year resignation rate (employees who leave the organization within one year/head count)</li> <li>First-year turnover rate (employees who leave the organization within one year/total number of recruits)</li> <li>Early turnover (percentage of recruits leaving in first year)</li> </ul>
Application rate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ratio-referral factor: number of candidates to number of openings</li> <li>Applicants per posting</li> <li>Qualified applicants per posting</li> <li>Application completion rate (number of people who completed an application/number of people who started an application)</li> <li>Number of internal candidates per posting; number of qualified internal candidates per posting</li> <li>Number of external candidates per posting; number of qualified external candidates per posting</li> <li>Yield ratio: number of applicants at one stage of the recruitment process compared with number of applicants at the subsequent stage</li> </ul>	Hiring	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Time between job requisition and first interview</li> <li>External hire rate: people hired externally as a percentage of head count</li> <li>Internal hire rate: people hired internally as a percentage of head count</li> <li>Time to hire: time between job requisition and offer</li> <li>Time to start: number of calendar days from the date of a requisition to the start date of the newly hired employee (may be calculated for internal and external hires)</li> <li>Offer acceptance rate: number of offers accepted as a percentage of all new hire offers extended (may also be calculated separately for internal and external hires, and by recruitment source)</li> <li>Time between job offer and offer acceptance</li> <li>Selection ratio (number of hired candidates/total number of candidates)</li> <li>Yield ratio (number of applicants who completed one stage of the application process/total number who entered the stage)</li> </ul>	Satisfaction	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recruiter/hiring manager satisfaction (number of hires who exhibit a high level of performance/total number of hires)</li> <li>Candidate job satisfaction (number of hires who rate themselves as satisfied with their job/total number of hires)</li> </ul>
				Miscellaneous	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Materials and other special or unplanned expenses, new employee orientation, reference checking, and drug screening</li> <li>Sign-on bonus percentage: number of new hires receiving a sign-on bonus as a percentage of new hires</li> </ul>

## Exhibit 7.5 Measures of Recruitment Effectiveness and Efficiency

# The Question of Fit

- Organizational fit includes how work is done in the organization, how people are treated, what behaviors are rewarded, and whether the culture is characterized by competition or cooperation.
- Research suggests that applicants conduct their own assessments of person–organization fit, and these perceptions are likely to change throughout the recruitment process and affect job choice decisions.
- This finding changes the dynamic of hiring, from a selection method that is based on concrete and observable indicators of person–job fit to a selection approach that seeks to assess person–organization fit.
- However, selection methods to assess fit are far from perfect and largely untested.
  - Arthur and colleagues (2006) state that if person–organization fit is used as a selection criterion, then measures must be held to the same psychometric and legal standards that apply to more traditional selection tests.

# Job Requirements and Selection Tools

- A more formalized critical incident analysis may also be used to identify the hidden or less formal aspects of a job.
- A critical incident analysis is designed to generate a list of good and poor examples of job performance by individuals who are knowledgeable about the job.
- The critical incident approach involves the following steps:
  - Identify job experts and select methods for collecting critical incidents.
  - Generate critical incidents.
  - Define job dimensions.

## Exhibit 7.6

### Common Selection Tools

Selection Tool	Purpose
Cognitive tests	Evaluate reasoning, memory, perceptual speed and accuracy, and skills in arithmetic and reading comprehension, as well as knowledge of a particular function or job
Physical ability tests	Measure the physical ability to perform a particular task or the strength of specific muscle groups, as well as strength and stamina in general
Sample job tasks, such as performance tests, simulations, work samples, and realistic job previews	Assess performance and aptitude on particular tasks
Medical inquiries and physical examinations, including psychological tests	Assess physical or mental health
Personality tests and integrity tests	Assess the degree to which a person has certain traits or dispositions, such as honesty, dependability, cooperativeness, or safety, or aim to predict the likelihood that a person will engage in undesirable conduct, such as theft, absenteeism, or conflict
Criminal background checks	Provide information on arrest and conviction history
Credit checks	Provide information on credit and financial history
Performance appraisals	Reflect a supervisor's assessment of an individual's performance
English proficiency tests	Determine English-language fluency

Job	Critical Incident	Job Dimensions
Staff physician, rural hospital	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In an administrative staff meeting to review plans for the coming year, this individual exhibited strongly condescending and rude behaviors toward other team members.</li> <li>• The physician effectively communicated with a non-English-speaking immigrant family with no interpreter available.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ability to work in teams</li> <li>• Respect for other professionals</li> <li>• Communication skills</li> <li>• Resourcefulness</li> </ul>
Nurse, emergency department	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• After a school bus accident, the emergency department was overwhelmed with children and frightened parents. This nurse effectively and appropriately managed communication with parents and successfully obtained further assistance from elsewhere in the hospital.</li> <li>• When an upset spouse of a family member with a nonurgent condition became angry and potentially violent, the nurse effectively defused the individual's anger while maintaining normal triage procedures in the emergency department.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Creativity and resourcefulness</li> <li>• Leadership</li> <li>• Community relations</li> <li>• Negotiation skills</li> <li>• Conflict resolution</li> <li>• Crisis management</li> </ul>
Medical director, local public health department	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The local media reported an outbreak of salmonella that resulted in the hospitalization of one child with this serious condition. The outbreak was traced to a fast-food restaurant that was inspected by health department personnel less than one week before the incident. The health department was blamed for not preventing the outbreak. This medical director conducted a thorough internal investigation and found that this outbreak was an isolated incident caused by mishandling of food on a single occasion. She communicated effectively at a press conference, defending the health department and assuring the public of the safety of local eating establishments.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ability to work effectively under crisis conditions</li> <li>• Strong interpersonal skills</li> <li>• Effective crisis manager</li> <li>• Strong communication and media skills</li> <li>• Strong sense of public accountability</li> </ul>
Medical director, community hospital	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• At an open community meeting, the medical director succeeded in defusing anger among community members resulting from the closing of a hospital service line.</li> <li>• On numerous occasions, the medical director successfully engaged other professionals in quality improvement activities.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Conflict management</li> <li>• Community relations</li> <li>• Leadership</li> <li>• Multidisciplinary orientation</li> <li>• Understanding of quality improvement philosophy</li> </ul>

## Exhibit 7.7

### Critical Incident Approach to Identifying Job Requirements

**Exhibit 7.8**  
Relative Reliability of  
Measurement of Human  
Attributes

Level of Reliability	Human Attributes
High	Personal <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Height</li><li>• Weight</li><li>• Vision</li><li>• Hearing</li></ul>
Medium	Attitudes and Skills <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Dexterity</li><li>• Mathematical skills</li><li>• Verbal ability</li><li>• Intelligence</li><li>• Clerical skills</li><li>• Mechanical skills</li></ul>
Medium to low	Interests <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Economic</li><li>• Scientific</li><li>• Mechanical</li><li>• Cultural</li></ul>
Low	Personality <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Sociability</li><li>• Dominance</li><li>• Cooperativeness</li><li>• Tolerance</li></ul>

## Exhibit 7.9

### Guidelines for the Appropriate Use of Reference Checks

- 
1. Ask for and obtain only job-related information.
  2. As the conversation proceeds, describe the job under consideration and the relationship the reference had with the applicant.
  3. Do not ask for information in an application or personal interview that may be deemed illegal.
  4. Applicants should provide written permission to contact references.
  5. Individuals who check references should be trained in interviewing techniques, including methods of probing and accurately recording reference information.
  6. Reference information should be recorded in writing immediately after the interview.
  7. Use the reference-checking process to confirm information provided by the application and to identify gaps in the employment record.
  8. Be aware of the possibility that the individual who provides a reference could be trying to damage a prospective employee by giving a negative reference.
  9. Use the references provided by the applicant as a source of additional references or information.
  10. While asking about an applicant's attendance record is permissible, avoid questions dealing with the employee's medical or disability status, use of sick leave or medical leave, or workers' compensation issues. Similarly, avoid questions related to the individual's home life and family.
-

---

**Personal and Marital Status**

- Inappropriate:
- How tall are you?
  - How much do you weigh? (acceptable if there are safety requirements)
  - What is your maiden name?
  - Are you married?
  - Is this your maiden or married name?
  - With whom do you live?
  - Do you smoke?
- Appropriate:
- After hiring, inquire about marital status for tax and insurance forms purposes.
  - Are you able to lift 50 pounds and carry it 20 yards? (acceptable if part of the job)
- 

**Parental Status and Family Responsibilities**

- Inappropriate:
- How many kids do you have?
  - Do you plan to have children?
  - What are your childcare arrangements?
  - Are you pregnant?
- Appropriate:
- Would you be willing to relocate if necessary?
  - Travel is an important part of this job. Would you be willing to travel as needed by the job?
  - This job requires overtime occasionally. Would you be able and willing to work overtime as necessary?
  - After hiring, inquire about dependent information for tax and insurance forms purposes.
- 

**Age**

- Inappropriate:
- How old are you?
  - What year were you born?
  - When did you graduate from high school and college?
- Appropriate:
- Before hiring, asking whether the applicant is above the legal minimum age for the hours or working conditions is appropriate, as this is in compliance with state or federal labor laws. After hiring, verifying legal minimum age with a birth certificate or other ID and asking for age on insurance forms are permissible.
- 

**National Origin**

- Inappropriate:
- Where were you born?
  - Where are your parents from?
  - What is your heritage?
  - What is your native tongue?
  - What languages do you read, speak, or write fluently? (acceptable if relevant to the job)
- 

- Appropriate:
- Are you authorized to work in the United States?
  - May we verify that you are a legal US resident, or may we have a copy of your work visa status?
- 

**Race or Skin Color**

- Inappropriate:
- What is your racial background?
  - Are you a member of a minority group?
- Appropriate:
- This organization is an equal opportunity employer. Race is required information only for affirmative action programs.
- 

**Religion or Creed**

- Inappropriate:
- What religion do you follow?
  - Which religious holidays will you be taking off from work?
  - Do you attend church regularly?
- Appropriate:
- May we contact religious or other organizations related to your beliefs to provide us with references, per your list of employers and references?
- 

**Criminal Record**

- Inappropriate:
- Have you ever been arrested?
  - Have you ever spent a night in jail?
- Appropriate:
- Questions about convictions by civil or military courts are appropriate if accompanied by a disclaimer that the answers will not necessarily cause loss of job opportunity. Generally, employers can ask only about convictions and not arrests (except for jobs in law enforcement and security clearance agencies) when the answers are relevant to the job performance.
- 

**Disability**

- Inappropriate:
- Do you have any disabilities?
  - What is your medical history?
  - How does your condition affect your abilities?
  - Please fill out this medical history document.
  - Have you had recent illnesses or hospitalizations?
  - When was your last physical exam?
  - Are you HIV positive?
- Appropriate:
- Can you perform specific physical tasks (lifting heavy objects, bending, kneeling) that are required for the job?
  - After hiring, asking about the person's medical history on insurance forms is appropriate.
  - Are you able to perform the essential functions of this job with or without reasonable accommodations?
- 

**Affiliations**

- Inappropriate:
- To what clubs or associations do you belong?
- Appropriate:
- Do you belong to any professional or trade groups or other organizations that you consider relevant to your ability to perform this job?
- 

## Exhibit 7.10 Inappropriate and Appropriate Job Interview Questions

## CHAPTER 7: RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION

**Bruce J. Fried**

### OVERVIEW

The chapter addresses the topic of staffing and, specifically, the processes of recruitment and selection. It proceeds from the assumption that recruitment, selection, and retention are interrelated. For example, the effectiveness of an organization's recruitment processes will have an impact on how selective decision makers can be in their choices. Retention is in large part dependent on how effectively selection processes are implemented. Discussion of recruitment focuses on key decisions organizations need to make in designing recruitment procedures, such as whether to recruit internally or externally. Discussion is also included about how individual job seekers decide whether to accept a job offer. The importance of the recruitment messages is emphasized, and examples are provided from leading healthcare organizations. Retention is highly dependent on the effectiveness of recruitment and selection; however, given its importance, a separate chapter focuses on employee retention.

Several aspects of the selection process are discussed. Organizational fit, selection tools, and different forms of validity are discussed. Guidelines for utilizing references and interviewing applicants are provided. The use of situational and experience-based interview questions is discussed, as well as the cautions about the use of questions that may lead to negative legal consequences.

### TEACHING SUGGESTIONS

1. An important lesson from this chapter is the need for a clear linkage between job requirements and the processes of recruitment and selection. One approach to this is for students to work with real job descriptions for jobs that are well understood and, ideally, have been subjected to recent job analysis. Students can follow the rubric of first defining the critical job requirements, which may already be listed in the job description. Looking at the content of the job, the first part of this exercise is for students to put together a recruitment plan, indicating where they will source

the job, the specific requirements, and the recruitment messages to be included in promoting the job. Next, students develop selection tools based on the key job requirements. This may include interview questions, various types of tests, and reference checks (including the questions that will be asked of references). This is best done in groups. If all groups use the same job, it is often very instructive to compare the work developed by different groups.

2. To help students appreciate the challenges in designing interview questions and carrying out a selection interview, a simulation can be very effective. One approach is to identify a job that may be of significant interest to students not in the class. In my experience with this exercise in my master's level class, I have used three to four undergraduate volunteers to act as job applicants and, for the purposes of the exercise, interviewees. Beginning with a job description or job advertisement, groups first analyze the job and identify the most important job requirements. Following this, groups design interview questions. Groups should also include responses to these questions that range from excellent to poor. The undergraduate volunteers submit their resumes to each group, so that questions can be not only job related but also individualized to the particular applicant. A simulated interview is then conducted with each applicant. Selecting questions from multiple groups can be done in a number of ways. One approach is for the instructor to select two to three questions from each group for use in the interview. Alternatively, each group can interview one of the applicants; this is workable depending on the size of the class. In debriefing the exercise, emphasis should be placed first on how effective the questions were in eliciting the responses, and whether the range of potential responses was demonstrated by applicants' answers. Secondly, groups can rank applicants on their suitability for the position. In my use of the exercise, volunteers are eager for feedback on their own performance as interviewees.

3. To reinforce content related to recruitment and retention, students can conduct interviews with HR leaders or recruiters on the particular challenges faced in recruitment and retention. This may focus on a particular professional group, or on issues related to the organization overall. Students can be asked to elicit information (which can then be used to produce a summary report) on recruitment challenges, the subjects' history, and supporting data. In addition, they can explore successful and unsuccessful retention strategies (ideally with supporting data).

4. Another approach that utilizes information from HR leaders involves students exploring the metrics organizations use to evaluate their recruitment and retention strategies. Students can learn about the metrics currently used (e.g., cost per hire) and problems in obtaining reliable data. HR leaders may share specific data with students, and student groups can use the interviews and data to develop a paper summarizing metrics currently used and providing recommendations on additional metrics that may provide additional useful information.

5. There are hospitals designated as Magnet hospitals, and they are an excellent source of best practices. Nurse leaders from a Magnet hospital can conduct a presentation on the qualities that earned them Magnet status, as well as data that led to and resulted from this designation. Ideally, two to three leaders can present sequentially and engage the class in a discussion of the most important qualities and management practices.

6. Another source of information is staff from professional search firms. As with other informants, students can conduct interviews with search firm staff, obtaining information about their processes, what types of organizations become clients (and why), how they work with clients, and difficult-to-recruit positions. Another approach is to utilize professional search firm staff as guest presenters.

7. Physician recruitment is a challenge in many communities. A project can be designed around physician recruitment in a particular community. For example, HR leaders in rural community health centers can be interviewed to learn about recruitment challenges, successful and unsuccessful strategies, and data that are used to measure the extent of a recruitment challenges (e.g., months to fill a position). These interviews often result in stories about recruitment efforts that succeeded, efforts that seemed to be leading to success but failed, and efforts that were idiosyncratic in some way.

## **DISCUSSION QUESTIONS**

1. *Given two equally qualified job applicants—one from inside and one from outside the organization—how would you go about deciding which one to hire?*

Considerations include the importance of bringing new skills and perspectives into the organization; whether there is evidence that the external applicant has the required nontechnical qualities required for success, such as value congruence and fit with the organization; whether the internal applicant brings valued institutional knowledge about the organization and job; how hiring an external person will affect morale among current employees; the cost and time required for onboarding each of the applicants; the possibility that hiring the internal applicant would cause disruption within the organization; and the extent to which the internal applicant has the technical competencies required for the position.

*2. For a variety of reasons, some healthcare organizations are unable to pay market rates for certain positions. What advice would you give such an organization about possible recruitment and retention strategies?*

Where compensation may be inadequate to compete with other organizations, attention should be given to the factors associated with intrinsic satisfaction. These include ensuring a positive and supportive organizational climate; communicating the high quality of supervision and peer relationships; ensuring that career pathways and opportunities for promotion are clearly understood; engaging current employees in the recruitment process; ensuring the availability of professional development activities, such as training and financing attendance at conferences; and emphasizing the team-oriented culture of the organization.

*3. The use of work references is increasingly viewed as unreliable. How can employers legally and ethically obtain information about an applicant's past performance? What measures can be taken to verify information contained in a job application or résumé?*

It is important to first understand the constraints under which a referee is operating. For example, does the reference's organization have specific policies about what can be said in a reference? In some cases, companies have a strict "no reference" policy. There may also be policies that mandate that references provide only a minimum amount of information, such as the individual's job title and dates of employment. There are also state laws relevant to reference material, and it is important to be aware of these laws (see <https://www.nolo.com/legal-encyclopedia/free-books/employee-rights-book/chapter9-6.html>). A job applicant may be willing to waive the opportunity (or right) to see written references. Where this is not waived, there is potential pressure on the referee to be less than honest in a reference. Honesty among references can also

be enhanced by personal conversation rather than reliance on only a written document. Information on job applications, including the résumé, may include false or misleading information. This may range from relatively innocuous information, such as exaggerating one's accomplishments, to far more serious issues, such as lying about a conviction for a crime, or fabricating educational background, credentials, or licensing. Where there is suspicion about a particular issue, additional sources of information may be consulted, such as the educational institution from which an individual graduated, state licensing boards, and credentialing agencies. One may also ask the applicant for supplementary verification of a particular claim. Public records may also be consulted as needed.

*4. What are the advantages and disadvantages of using the internet for recruitment? What advice would you give to a hospital that is considering using the internet for recruitment?*

At this point, the use of the internet is ubiquitous in recruitment, and there are multiple avenues through which the internet is used. Advantages include relatively low cost; the ability to reach a large market; the ability to use online recruitment websites to screen applicants; the ability to use artificial intelligence (AI) technology to quickly screen applicants; and the ability to rapidly place or modify information about job openings. Disadvantages include possibly getting a disproportionate number of applications from people who are not qualified due to the ease of submitting online applications, obtaining misleading information from AI screening programs, and challenges in targeting certain markets with information.

## **EXPERIENTIAL EXERCISES DISCUSSION**

### **Sexual Orientation Discrimination**

This case generates considerable discussion, and students typically have strong opinions about the situation. There are at least five issues in this case:

1. The legality of not hiring Keith would not have been an issue until relatively recently, with the Supreme Court's decision related to discrimination based on sexual preference. There is thus legal liability should Keith be declined a job offer. However, should a more qualified applicant

be found, the Wabash Community Health Center could make the case that declining an offer to Keith was not based on his protected class characteristic.

2. The morality of not hiring Keith simply because of his sexual orientation is clearly a critical issue, regardless of technically legal questions.

3. Kathleen's position opposing hiring Keith is made clearly on the grounds of his having "an alternative lifestyle" with which she disapproves. Keith's sexual preference has no relevance to requirements for the position to which he is applying. Thus, her position to base hiring on a non-job-related personal characteristic violates accepted practices of employee selection.

4. The Health Center is having difficulty filling this position, and not hiring a fully competent applicant puts the center at a competitive disadvantage. It is also disadvantageous to current staff who are unable to meet patient demand and to patients in need of physical therapy services.

5. Jerry attempts to make the case that hiring Keith would put the center at a disadvantage and that patients would resist being seen by a gay person, and perhaps even mistreat him. He is thus making the business case for discrimination, a very dubious position to take. Students who support this view or see it as potentially valid may be challenged about the validity of denying a job to someone because of their race because a sizeable number of people in the community are racist.

Instructors should be aware of the sensitivity of the subject matter in this case, recognizing the varied backgrounds of students and the strength of their particular worldviews.

### **Project on Workforce Shortages**

This project is particularly useful not only because of its content related to exploring the supply of a particular health professional group, but also because students are challenged to find valid information about the issue. Thus, students learn about the difficulty in conducting research in this area. The assignment may also be modified to meet the particular interests of the instructor or students. For example, where groups of students are assigned to look at the same professional group in multiple organizations, comparisons may be made between organizations on supply and shortage issues, as well as the strategies used in addressing problems. In addition, students may

find that stakeholders in a particular organization may differ in their perception of the problem and proposed solutions.