This is a sample of the instructor materials for *Human Resources in Healthcare: Managing for Success*, Fourth Edition, edited by Bruce J. Fried and Myron D. Fottler.

The complete instructor materials include the following:

- Test bank
- Chapter manuals with teaching tips, class activities, and discussion exercises
- PowerPoint slides

This sample includes the chapter manual and presentation slides for Chapter 7, “Recruitment, Selection, and Retention.”

If you adopt this text, you will be given access to the complete materials. To obtain access, e-mail your request to hapbooks@ache.org and include the following information in your message:

- Book title
- Your name and institution name
- Title of the course for which the book was adopted and the season the course is taught
- Course level (graduate, undergraduate, or continuing education) and expected enrollment
- The use of the text (primary, supplemental, or recommended reading)
- A contact name and phone number/e-mail address we can use to verify your employment as an instructor

You will receive an e-mail containing access information after we have verified your instructor status. Thank you for your interest in this text and the accompanying instructor resources.

**Digital and Alternative Formats**

Individual chapters of this book are available for instructors to create customized textbooks or course packs at XanEdu/AcademicPub. Students can also purchase this book in digital formats from the following e-book partners: BrytWave, Chegg, CourseSmart, Kno, and Packback. For more information about pricing and availability, please visit one of these preferred partners or contact Health Administration Press at hapbooks@ache.org.
CHAPTER 7: RECRUITMENT, SELECTION, AND RETENTION

Bruce J. Fried and Michael Gates

OVERVIEW

The chapter proceeds from the assumption that recruitment, selection, and retention are interrelated. For example, the effectiveness of an organization’s recruitment processes will have an impact on how selective decision makers can be in their choices. Retention is in large part dependent upon how effectively selection processes are implemented. Discussion of recruitment focuses on key decisions organizations need to make in designing recruitment procedures, such as whether to recruit internally or externally. Discussion is also included about how individual job seekers decide whether to accept a job offer. The importance of the recruitment messages is emphasized, and examples are provided from leading healthcare organizations including Kaiser Permanente and the Mayo Clinic.

Several aspects of the selection process are discussed. Organizational fit, selection tools, and different forms of validity are discussed. Guidelines for utilizing references and interviewing applicants are provided. The use of situational and experience-based interview questions is discussed, as well as the cautions about the use of questions that may lead to negative legal consequences. Turnover is discussed, with a focus on nurse turnover and retention. Common reasons for turnover and retention strategies are discussed.

TEACHING SUGGESTIONS

1. An important lesson from this chapter is the need for a clear linkage between job requirements and the processes of recruitment and selection. One approach to this is for students to work with real job descriptions for jobs that are well understood and, ideally, have been subjected to recent job analysis. Students can follow the rubric of first defining the critical job requirements, which may already be listed in the job description. Looking at the content of the job, the first part of this exercise is for students to put together a recruitment plan, indicating where they will source the job, the specific requirements, and the recruitment messages to be
included in promoting the job. Next, students develop selection tools based on the key job requirements. This may include interview questions, various types of tests, and reference checks (including the questions that will be asked of references). This is best done in groups. If all groups use the same job, it is often very instructive to compare the work developed by different groups.

2. To help students appreciate the challenges in designing interview questions and carrying out a selection interview, a simulation can be very effective. One approach is to identify a job that may be of significant interest to students not in the class. In my experience with this exercise in my master’s level class, I have used 3–4 undergraduate volunteers to act as job applicants and, for the purposes of the exercise, interviewees. Beginning with a job description or job advertisement, groups first analyze the job and identify the most important job requirements. Following this, groups design interview questions. Groups should also include responses to these questions that range from excellent to poor. The undergraduate volunteers submit their resumes to each group, so that questions can be not only job related but individualized to the particular applicant. A simulated interview is then conducted with each applicant. Selecting questions from multiple groups can be done in a number of ways. One approach is for the instructor to select 2–3 questions from each group for use in the interview. Alternatively, each group can interview one of the applicants; this is workable depending upon the size of the class. In debriefing the exercise, emphasis should be placed first on how effective the questions were in eliciting the responses, and whether the range of potential responses was demonstrated by applicants’ answers. Secondarily, groups can rank applicants on their suitability for the position. In my use of the exercise, volunteers are eager for feedback on their own performance as interviewees.

3. To reinforce content related to recruitment and retention, students can conduct interviews with HR leaders or recruiters on the particular challenges faced in recruitment and retention. This may focus on a particular professional group, or on issues related to the organization overall. Students can be asked to elicit information (which can then be used to produce a summary report) on recruitment challenges, the subjects’ history, and supporting data. In addition, they can explore successful and unsuccessful retention strategies (ideally with supporting data).
4. Another approach that utilizes information from HR leaders involves students exploring the metrics organizations use to evaluate their recruitment and retention strategies. Students can learn about the metrics currently used (e.g., cost per hire) and problems in obtaining reliable data. HR leaders may share specific data with students, and student groups can use the interviews and data to develop a paper summarizing metrics currently used and providing recommendations on additional metrics that may provide additional useful information.

5. There are hospitals designated as Magnet hospitals, and they are an excellent source of best practices. Nurse leaders from a Magnet hospital can conduct a presentation on the qualities that earned them Magnet status, as well as data that led to and resulted from this designation. Ideally, 2–3 leaders can present sequentially and engage the class in a discussion of the most important qualities and management practices.

6. Another source of information are staff from professional search firms. As with other informants, students can conduct interviews with search firm staff, obtaining information about their processes, what types of organizations become clients (and why), how they work with clients, and difficult-to-recruit positions. Another approach is to utilize professional search firm staff as guest presenters.

7. Physician recruitment is a challenge in many communities. A project can be designed around physician recruitment in a particular community. For example, HR leaders in rural community health centers can be interviewed to learn about recruitment challenges, successful and unsuccessful strategies, and data that are used to measure the extent of a recruitment challenges (e.g., months to fill a position). These interviews often result in stories about recruitment efforts that succeeded, efforts that seemed to be leading to success but failed, and efforts that were idiosyncratic in some way.
ADDITIONAL DISCUSSION QUESTIONS

1. Gaining popularity in recent years is the idea of hiring employees on the basis of person–organization fit. Explain what is meant by person–organization fit. What are the challenges of hiring employees on the basis of fit?

   *Key areas to address in the answer:*

   - Person–organization fit refers to the extent to which an applicant fits with the values and culture of the organization. Value congruence is an important element in fit.
   - Issues and challenges:
     - Applicants conduct their own assessments of fit, and these may be different from organizational perceptions.
     - Applicants’ perception of fit may change during the recruitment and hiring process.
     - Selection methods for hiring for fit are imprecise and largely untested.
     - The relationship between fit and job performance is not clear.
     - Person–organization fit is difficult to achieve in some circumstances, such as hard-to-fill positions.
     - Importance of fit varies by job and work environment.
     - Hiring for fit may have legal complications (e.g., “a woman would not fit into our male-dominated culture”).

2. Describe what is meant by the reliability and validity of selection tools. Summarize the different types of validity and how each is used.

   *Key areas to address in the answer:*

   - Reliability refers to repeatability or consistency in a selection tool. A selection tool is reliable if it provides the same result repeatedly, assuming the trait that it measures does not change. It also means that findings will be identical regardless of who administers the tool. An example of this would be height or gender.
   - Validity refers to the relationship between a selection tool and job criteria.
• Content validity is the extent to which a selection tool representatively samples the content of the job.

• Construct validity refers to the degree to which a selection tool measures the construct it is intended to measure.

• Criterion-related validity is the extent to which a selection tool is associated with or predicts actual job performance.
  o Concurrent validity (including a summary of how concurrent validity is established)
  o Predictive validity (including a description of how predictive validity is established)

3. Summarize five major reasons for nurse turnover and three proven strategies to improve retention.

Key areas to address in the answer:

• Among the reasons to be mentioned are poor, unsupportive, unresponsive management; low compensation; work overload; inadequate staffing; and lack of respect and appreciation from management.

• Strategies to improve retention include the following:
  o Competitive compensation, which may include signing bonuses, premium and differential pay, forgivable loans, benefits
  o A “culture of retention”
  o Extensive benefits
  o Restructuring jobs
  o Strong management and supervisory team
  o Providing opportunities for career growth
  o Magnet hospital qualities—fewer hierarchical levels, decentralization, flexibility in scheduling, positive nurse–physician relationships, investment in career development
Chapter 7:
Recruitment, Selection, and Retention
Recruitment

• Goal is to generate a pool of qualified job applicants
• Recruitment includes a range of processes
• Key questions addressed:
  – Recruit from within, or focus on external applicants?
  – Consider alternative approaches to filling jobs, such as outsourcing, flexible staffing, and contingent worker?
  – Focus on technical qualifications or fit with the culture of the organization?
Factors Influencing Job Choice

• Attractiveness of position and organization
• One’s own competitiveness in the job market and availability of other positions
• Attitudes and behaviors of recruiter or person of first contact
• Compensation and opportunities for growth
• People vary in what they consider important
• Three general factors
  – Characteristics of the organization and job
  – Individual factors
  – Fit
Characteristics Affecting Job Choice

- Individual characteristics: e.g., career stage, geographic preferences, family considerations
- Organizational characteristics
  - Total compensation
  - Challenge and responsibility
  - Advancement and professional development
  - Job security
  - Geographic location
The Recruitment Process

• Importance of a human resources plan
  – Organization’s strategies
  – Types of individuals required
  – Recruitment and hiring approaches
  – Statement of how HR practices support organizational goals

• Clear understanding of the job (e.g., tasks, knowledge, skills, abilities)

• Examination of external job market factors and recruitment sources
Information Requirements

A human resources information system should maintain information useful for recruitment:

• Skills and knowledge inventory
• Previous job applicants
• Recruitment source information
  – Yield ratios
  – Cost
  – Cost per applicant
  – Cost per hire
• Applicant tracking
• Employee performance and retention information
Internal vs. External Recruitment

Advantages of internal recruitment
- Improve morale and motivation
- Easier to assess applicants
- May be faster and lower cost
- Applicants understand organization
- May reinforce employees’ sense of job security

Disadvantages of internal recruitment
- Morale problems among those not selected
- Inbreeding
- Conflict among internal applicants
- May require strong training
- May manifest the “Peter Principle” (i.e., people rise in the organization until they are no longer competent to do the job)
- Ripple effects in vacancies
Internal vs. External Recruitment

Advantages of external recruitment
- Brings in new ideas
- May be less expensive than training internal applicants
- Ensures applicants do not have dysfunctional relationships with others in the organization

Disadvantages of external recruitment
- Applicants may have technical skills but not fit the culture
- Morale problems among internal applicants not selected
- May require longer adjustment
- Uncertainty about applicant skills compared with internal applicants
Employee Selection

Selection is the process of collecting and evaluating applicant information

• Technical skills and other job requirements

• Person–organization fit and value congruence include
  – how work is done
  – how people are treated
  – what behaviors are rewarded
  – cooperative vs. competitive culture
Selection Tools

Selection tools are procedures or systems used to obtain job-related information about job applicants. They vary in reliability.

- Cognitive tests
- Physical ability tests
- Sample job tasks
- Medical inquiries
- Personal tests
- Criminal background and credit checks
- Performance appraisals
- Language proficiency
Job Interviews

• Purpose is to obtain information not available from other sources

• Job interviews are often given a great deal of weight, but may lack reliability and validity
  – Questions may vary from interviewer to interviewer
  – Applicants may “fake” answers
  – Questions may not be related to the job
  – Questions often not standardized, leading to inequitable treatment
  – Untrained interviewers may ask inappropriate questions
Turnover and Retention

• Turnover is expensive, by any measure
• Many environmental factors are associated with shortages
• Distinction between turnover and retention
  – Turnover rate is a ratio providing a summary of gross movement in and out of the organization
  – Retention rate is the percentage of employees who are employed at the beginning of a period and who remain at the end of the period
Major Reasons for Nursing Turnover

• Dissatisfaction
• Heavy workload
• Scheduling
• Lack of autonomy
• Lack of intrinsic and extrinsic rewards
• Insufficient time with patients
• Dissatisfying relationships with peers, managers, and colleagues
Retention Strategies

• Competitive compensation
• Structure jobs so that they are more appealing and satisfying
• Put in place a strong management and supervisory team
• Create opportunities for career growth, including career ladders and alternatives to promotion
• Reduce patient–nurse ratios
• Improve hiring and onboarding processes